

His Father's Namesake

Lesson 4: DBQ Essay

Focus Questions

Did the Haymarket Affair represent a miscarriage of justice? What were the opposing positions of the anarchists and the city leaders? How can historical documents and secondary sources be used to support or refute a thesis?

Core Understandings

Students will understand the complex forces that resulted in the trial and hanging of the Haymarket leaders. They will understand both the position of the anarchists and the opposing position of the Chicago establishment. They will understand how primary and secondary sources are used to support or refute historical positions.

Knowledge

Students will know the key historical figures, circumstances, and events surrounding the 1886 Haymarket trial. They will know why the trial was considered a gross miscarriage of justice. They will know how to cite primary source documents and secondary scholarship to support or refute a thesis.

Skills

Students will use their analytical skills to interpret primary and secondary historical sources. They will use their writing skills to persuasively argue a position.

Common Core ELA Standards

CCSS.R.1. Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.
CCSS.R.2. Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.
CCSS.R.7. Integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse media and formats, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words.
CCSS.R.8. Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.
CCSS.W.1. Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

ISBE Social Science Standards

Goal 15: Understand economic systems, with an emphasis on the US.
Goal 16: Understand events, trends, individuals and movements shaping the history of Illinois, the US, and other nations.
Goal 17: Understand world geography and the effects of geography on society, with an emphasis on the US.
Goal 18: Understand social systems, with an emphasis on the US.

In This Lesson

Students will write an essay on the Haymarket trial using the document-based questions approach. The story element of resolution is addressed. This lesson was researched and written by Jackson Potter.



Activity

Begin by distributing copies of the Haymarket Essay handout (at the end of this lesson) and printouts of the artifact image set for *His Father's Namesake*. http://www.chicagohistory.org/greatchicagostories/pdf/artifacts/artifacts_namesake.pdf

Direct students to write a two-page essay in response to the following question: Did the Haymarket Affair represent a miscarriage of justice? Students should complete this assignment using a document-based questions (DBQ) approach. Students should draw upon all resources provided in the unit thus far including: the Work in Chicago and Workplace Scenarios handouts from Lesson 1; the *City of the Century* excerpt from Lesson 2; the artifact image set printouts (above); and the *Great Chicago Stories* interactive history map. See additional resources under Materials & Resources.

Essays should be structured according to the following outline:

- Introduce the background story and lay out a thesis.
- Provide a basic synopsis of the thesis supported by at least six primary or secondary source documents.
- Lay out the merits of an opposing view, supported by evidence and documents.
- Explain why the chosen argument prevails, comparing and contrasting documents and other evidence.

Lesson 4 Home Connection

Have students interview an adult about their work experiences. Here are some suggested questions for the oral interview: 1) What is your job? How many hours a week do you work? 2) Do you think that, in general, relations between employees and their bosses are good today? Why or why not? 3) Do you think this has changed over time? Explain.

Materials & Resources

- **Printouts of the Haymarket Essay handout** (at the end of lesson)
- **Printouts of the *His Father's Namesake* artifact image set:**
http://www.chicagohistory.org/greatchicagostories/pdf/artifacts/artifacts_namesake.pdf
- **Printouts of the Work in Chicago handout** (from Lesson 1)
- **Printouts of the Workplace Scenarios handout** (from Lesson 1)
- **Excerpt from *City of the Century: The Epic of Chicago and the Making of America*, by Donald L. Miller** (from Lesson 2)
- **“Labor Unrest in Chicago, April 25–May 4, 1886,” a rich map from the *Electronic Encyclopedia of Chicago*** (optional):
<http://encyclopedia.chicagohistory.org/pages/10002.html>
- ***The Dramas of Haymarket*, an online Chicago History Museum resource** (optional):
<http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas>

Instructional Notes

The *Great Chicago Stories* website offers worksheets for guided analysis of artifacts, documents, and photographs that could be used to support the DBQ approach. See the “Artifact Analysis” tab within the Classroom Activities section. <http://www.chicagohistory.org/greatchicagostories/classroom/artifact.php>

Extension Activities

Have students read one of the oral history interviews from Studs Terkel's *Working* and write an essay comparing it to the experience of workers in 1886.

Handout: DBQ Haymarket Essay

Did the execution of four leaders of the Haymarket rally represent a miscarriage of justice?

Today you will write a two-page essay in response to question above. In order to answer this question you will be required to use a document-based questions (DBQ) approach citing at least six pieces of evidence. Draw upon all resources provided in the unit so far including: the Work in Chicago and Workplace Scenarios handouts (Lesson 1); *City of the Century* excerpt (Lesson 2); the artifact image set printouts (distributed today); and the *Great Chicago Stories* interactive history map.

For example, if you decide that the anarchist leaders deserved the death sentence, here is something you might write:

It is clear that the anarchists were a violent and disorderly bunch, bent on violence and troublemaking since they even carried guns. (Source: Engraving of Haymarket bombing from *Harper's Weekly*.)

Or you might argue the opposite:

The anarchists were simply trying to defend themselves from the brutal police tactics such as those used at the McCormick Reaper Works strike (*City of the Century*, page 474), and were only violent inasmuch as they had to be.

Please structure your essay according to the following format:

- I. Introduce the background story and lay out a thesis.
- II. Lay out the merits of your thesis, supported by evidence and documents.
- III. Lay out the merits of an opposing view, supported by evidence and documents.
- IV. Explain why your chosen argument prevails, comparing and contrasting documents and other evidence.